

Appendix

WORKSHOP AGENDA

DAY ONE

8:00 a.m. Continental Breakfast

8:30a.m. Welcome

Dr. John Ahearne, Chair, NAE CEES Advisory Group
Dr. Francisco Ayala, Member, OBAS Committee, COSEPUP

8:45a.m. Statement of Meeting Goals

Dr. Richard Bissell, Executive Director, Division of Policy and Global Affairs, National Research Council (NRC)
Dr. Rachelle Hollander, Director, CEES, NAE

9:00 a.m. Meeting Logistics

9:10 a.m. Introductions of Meeting Attendees

10:00 a.m. Session I: Needs and Issues for Ethics Education in Scientific & Engineering Research

Investigators and students exist in complex research and learning environments that include academic and other organizations such as professional societies, commercial research laboratories, government funding agencies, and peer-reviewed journals. What do these individuals and groups identify as the main impediments to developing effective responsible research programs? Are there conflicting ideas about what these impediments are and what to do about them?

Moderator: Francisco Ayala

Speakers: Joseph Helble, Deborah Johnson, Michael Mumford, Wendy Williams

Respondents: Paul Citron, Hugh Gusterson, Susan Silbey

Short Break

General Discussion

Noon Lunch and Role-Play Exercise “Getting Results”

Facilitator: Stephanie Bird

1:30 p.m. Session II: Pedagogical Methods and Materials

There is quite a variety of both methods and materials in effect. More than a few consortia provide on-line tutorials; conferences are common. What kinds of contents and range of techniques are in use? What are their strengths and their limitations? Whom do they reach, and with what results? What information do we have that enables us to judge their merits? What's missing?

Moderator: John Ahearne

Speakers: Julia Frugoli, Kelly Laas, Caroline Whitbeck, Sara Wilson

Respondents: Jason Borenstein, J. Britt Holbrook, Simil Raghavan

General Discussion

3:30 p.m. Break

3:45 p.m. Session III: Outreach and Assessment

Are relevant and important materials and techniques reaching the appropriate audiences? Who are the appropriate audiences, and are there useful feedback loops from them to the developers of materials, techniques, and guidance? Are the audiences able to adapt or adopt these resources? What efforts might improve access, use, and feedback and improvement? What kinds of assessment have been developed, make sense, or should be encouraged for the future? What have we learned and what do we need to learn?

Moderator: Felice Levine

Speakers: Melissa Anderson, Daniel Denecke, Brian Schrag, Joseph Whittaker

Respondents: Carl Lineberger, Charles Huff

Short Break

General Discussion

5:15 p.m. Review of Sessions I, II and III

What can we conclude about how to develop and implement programs, how to export them, and how to assess their effectiveness? What can we conclude about development and use of effective methods and materials? What kinds of research, resource development and dissemination and assessment activities do we need in order to respond more effectively in the future?

Moderator: Mark Frankel

7:00 p.m. Working Dinner at the Marian Koshland Science Museum

Speaker: Richard Bissell, On Being a Scientist

Informal conversation and continuation of discussion as needed or desired. The workshop planning group will meet at dinner to discuss meeting's progress and assign follow-up duties.

DAY TWO

8:00 a.m. Continental Breakfast

8:30 a.m. Next Steps

This session will draft an initial version of the meeting summary, based on the previous day's discussion and attendees' reflections about it. The workshop summary will identify currently promising materials and practices and provide examples of successful approaches and outcomes, including those that have created bridges between research investigators and scholars and researchers with expertise in relevant domains of science and engineering ethics. It will identify gaps in accessible and useful resources and in the knowledge base, and suggest future research, educational innovations, and outreach and dissemination activities.

Moderator: Rachelle Hollander

Noon Lunch and Follow-On Assignments

2:00 p.m. Adjourn

WORKSHOP PARTICIPANTS

John F. Ahearne
Sigma Xi
Research Triangle Park, NC

Melissa S. Anderson
Department of Educational Policy and
Administration
University of Minnesota, Minneapolis

Francisco J. Ayala
Department of Ecology & Evolutionary Biology
University of California, Irvine

Stephanie J. Bird
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Jason Borenstein
School of Public Policy
Georgia Institute of Technology

Paul Citron
University of California, San Diego
(Retired from Medtronic, Inc.)

Daniel Denecke
Best Practices and Publications
Council of Graduate Schools

Kathleen Flint
National Postdoctoral Association

Mark S. Frankel
AAAS

Julia Frugoli
Department of Genetics & Biochemistry
CAFLS, Clemson University

Hugh Gusterson
Department of Sociology & Anthropology
George Mason University

Joseph J. Helble
Dean, Thayer School of Engineering
Dartmouth College

J. Britt Holbrook
Department of Philosophy and Religion Studies
University of North Texas

Charles Huff
Psychology Department
St. Olaf College

Deborah G. Johnson
Science, Technology and Society
University of Virginia

Kelly Laas
Center for the Study of Ethics in the Professions
Illinois Institute of Technology

Felice J. Levine
Executive Director
American Educational Research Association

W. Carl Lineberger
Department of Chemistry and Biochemistry
JILA
University of Colorado

Michael D. Mumford
Department of Psychology
University of Oklahoma

Simil L. Raghavan
Biomedical Engineering
Johns Hopkins University

Brian Schrag
Association for Practical and Professional Ethics

Susan Silbey
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Caroline Whitbeck
Case Western Reserve University

Joseph A. Whittaker
SCMNS-Office of the Dean
Dixon Science Research Center
Morgan State University

Wendy Reed Williams
The Children's Hospital of Philadelphia

Sara Wilson
Department of Mechanical Engineering
University of Kansas

NSF OBSERVERS

Scott Borg
Office of Polar Programs

Jean Feldmann
Policy Office

Peggy Fischer
Office of Inspector General

Doug H. Fisher
Directorate for Computer and Information
Sciences and Engineering

Edward Hackett
Directorate for Social, Behavioral, and
Economic Sciences

Susann Hamm
Directorate for Mathematical & Physical
Sciences

Samantha Hunter
Policy Office

Carter Kimsey
Directorate for Biological Sciences

Melanie Roberts
Directorate for Social, Behavioral and
Economic Sciences

Karen Santoro
Office of the General Counsel

Laurel Smith-Doerr
Science, Technology and Society
Division of Social and Economic Sciences

Diane Spreser
Directorate for Education & Human Resources

WORKSHOP SECRETARIAT

Rachelle Hollander
Center for Engineering, Ethics, and Society
National Academy of Engineering

Richard Bissell
Division of Policy and Global Affairs
The National Academies

Kathrin Humphrey
Division of Policy and Global Affairs
The National Academies

Jacqueline Martin
NAE Awards Office